

English 110

Evaluation Essay

Grading Calibration

The English Department of Monmouth College agrees that an evaluation paper makes an evaluative claim (a judgment) based on criteria (Good Reasons). Students should clearly state a judgment and back it up with a convincing argument based on standards of value that are appropriate for judging a specific kind of subject. When evaluating a subject, students should argue for why the subject is good or bad, acceptable or unacceptable, useful or not useful. Students need to fit the subject into a particular class that has particular criteria or standards by which members of that class are measured.

Sample Essays

Essay #1: “Feisty and Free” (A-/B+)

The “Feisty and Free” essay provided the reader with mostly clear criteria (one criteria is a bit fuzzy) and a fully-developed evaluation with the exception of the thesis needing more definition. Information is incorporated well, is amply supported with evidence, and is specific. The writer seems to be an expert with a mature syntax, good tone, and a clear sense of audience, although the piece almost reads like a brochure while also wandering into a persuasive essay style. Therefore, the department justifies the grade as approximately an A-/B+ since individual grades were A, A, A, A-, A-, B+, B+, B+, C- .

Essay #2: “An Album That Deserves Your Ears” (C-)

The “An Album That Deserves Your Ears” essay has a good thesis, structure, and an appropriate topic, yet the content of the paper destroys the thesis due to a lack of support and weak explanations. The content is rather redundant with only one comparison to another album provided. While the paper attempts a rebuttal some criteria, it is not thoughtful (almost vapid), it has too many major grammatical errors, and it follows a formula for writing that is too rigid. Therefore, the department justifies the grade as approximately a C- since individual grades were C, C, C-, C-, C-, C-, D, D, F.