English 110

Evaluation Essay

Grading Calibration

The English Department of Monmouth College agrees that an evaluation paper makes an evaluative claim (a judgment) based on criteria (<u>Good Reasons</u>). Students should clearly state a judgment and back it up with a convincing argument based on standards of value that are appropriate for judging a specific kind of subject. When evaluating a subject, students should argue for why the subject is good or bad, acceptable or unacceptable, useful or not useful. Students need to fit the subject into a particular class that has particular criteria or standards by which members of that class are measured.

Sample Essays

Essay #1: "Feisty and Free" (A-/B+)

The "Feisty and Free" essay provides the reader with mostly clear criteria ("ease of use" criteria is a bit fuzzy) and a fully-developed evaluation with the exception of the thesis needing more definition. Specific evidence is incorporated well. Even though the piece almost reads like a brochure that wanders from a persuasive essay style, the writer seems to be an expert with a mature syntax, good tone, and a clear sense of audience. Therefore, the department justifies the grade as approximately an A-/B+.

Essay #2: "An Album That Deserves Your Ears" (C-)

The "An Album That Deserves Your Ears" essay has a good thesis, structure, and an appropriate topic, yet the content of the paper does not fully support the thesis due to a lack of evidence and weak explanations with only one comparison to another album provided. The content is rather redundant since it repeats a comparison to only one other album. While the paper attempts a rebuttal of some opposing views, it is not thoughtful, it has too many major grammatical errors, and it follows a formula for writing that is too rigid. Therefore, the department justifies the grade as approximately a C-.